



BUSINESS, CONSUMER SERVICES AND HOUSING AGENCY • GAVIN NEWSOM, GOVERNOR  
DEPARTMENT OF CONSUMER AFFAIRS • CALIFORNIA BOARD OF CHIROPRACTIC EXAMINERS  
1625 N. Market Blvd., Suite N-327, Sacramento, CA 95834

P (916) 263-5355 | Toll-Free (866) 543-1311 | F (916) 327-0039 | [www.chiro.ca.gov](http://www.chiro.ca.gov)



## **BOARD OF CHIROPRACTIC EXAMINERS MEETING MINUTES**

**January 12, 2024**

The Board of Chiropractic Examiners (Board) met via teleconference/Webex Events on January 12, 2024, from the following locations:

Department of Consumer Affairs  
Ruby Room  
1747 N. Market Blvd., Suite 182  
Sacramento, CA 95834

4100 W. Alameda Avenue  
Third Floor  
Burbank, CA 91505

28000 Rancho Parkway  
Meeting Room  
Lake Forest, CA 92630

3455 Knighton Road  
Redding, CA 96002

1165 Park Avenue  
San Jose, CA 95126

101 Andrieux Street  
Sonoma, CA 95476

### **Board Members Present**

David Paris, D.C., Chair  
Laurence Adams, D.C., Vice Chair  
Rafael Sweet, Secretary  
Janette N.V. Cruz  
Pamela Daniels, D.C.  
Claudia Sandino, D.C.

### **Staff Present**

Kristin Walker, Executive Officer  
Tammi Pitto, Assistant Executive Officer  
Dixie Van Allen, Licensing & Administration Manager  
Amanda Ah Po, Enforcement Analyst  
Sabina Knight, Board Counsel, Attorney III, Department of Consumer Affairs (DCA)  
Steven Vong, Regulatory Counsel, Attorney III, DCA

### **1. Open Session – Call to Order / Roll Call / Establishment of a Quorum**

Dr. Paris called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m. Mr. Sweet called the roll. All Board members were present from the following teleconference locations: Dr. Paris in Redding; Dr. Adams in Sonoma; Mr. Sweet in Burbank; Ms. Cruz in Sacramento; Dr. Daniels in San Jose; and Dr. Sandino in Lake Forest. A quorum was established.

## **2. Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda**

**Public Comment:** Falkyn Luouxmont, a student at Life Chiropractic College West (Life West), asked the Board to be involved with a mislabeled clinic order based on the difference between Current Procedural Terminology (CPT) codes 99211 and 99213.

## **3. Board Chair's Report**

Dr. Paris welcomed Dr. Sandino to the Board. Dr. Sandino shared that she graduated from Life West, practiced chiropractic in Spain for 15 years where she was involved with the initiation of two universities and was one of the first 100 chiropractors, and has worked with children, pregnancies, and soccer teams.

Dr. Paris emphasized his appreciation for the Board members' dedication, teamwork, and involvement in outreach. He shared that he and Ms. Walker represented the Board at the California Chiropractic Association's Fall Conference in November 2023 and were able to engage with many licensees and other stakeholders. He acknowledged Dr. Adams' outreach and presentation on ethics to licensees and Dr. Daniels' engagement and discussions with academic leaders. He also thanked Ms. Cruz and Mr. Sweet for their work on the Government and Public Affairs Committee.

**Public Comment:** None.

## **4. Elections of Board Officers for 2024:**

- A. Chair
- B. Vice Chair
- C. Secretary

Ms. Knight presided over the election of Board officers for 2024. She noted Dr. Paris was previously nominated for the position of Chair during the October 19, 2023 meeting and called for any additional nominations. None were made.

**Ms. Knight called for public comment and a vote on the nomination of Dr. Paris as Chair.**

**Public Comment:** None.

**Vote: 6-0 (Dr. Paris-AYE, Dr. Adams-AYE, Mr. Sweet-AYE, Ms. Cruz-AYE, Dr. Daniels-AYE, and Dr. Sandino-AYE).**

**Motion: Carried.**

Ms. Knight noted Dr. Adams was previously nominated for the position of Vice Chair during the October 19, 2023 meeting and called for any additional nominations. None were made.

**Ms. Knight called for public comment and a vote on the nomination of Dr. Adams as Vice Chair.**

**Public Comment:** None.

**Vote: 6-0 (Dr. Paris-AYE, Dr. Adams-AYE, Mr. Sweet-AYE, Ms. Cruz-AYE, Dr. Daniels-AYE, and Dr. Sandino-AYE).**

**Motion: Carried.**

Ms. Knight noted Ms. Cruz was previously nominated for the position of Secretary during the October 19, 2023 meeting and called for any additional nominations. None were made.

**Ms. Knight called for public comment and a vote on the nomination of Ms. Cruz as Secretary.**

**Public Comment:** None.

**Vote: 6-0 (Dr. Paris-AYE, Dr. Adams-AYE, Mr. Sweet-AYE, Ms. Cruz-AYE, Dr. Daniels-AYE, and Dr. Sandino-AYE).**

**Motion: Carried.**

**5. Department of Consumer Affairs (DCA) Report Which May Include Updates on DCA's Administrative Services, Human Resources, Enforcement, Information Technology, Communications and Outreach, and Legislative, Regulatory, or Policy Matters**

Judie Bucciarelli from DCA's Office of Board and Bureau Relations updated the Board on the efforts of DCA's DEI Steering Committee to develop information and resources for the hiring process, the latest issue of DCA's *Consumer Connection* magazine, and the current year expenditure freeze issued by the Department of Finance (DOF) based on a significant projected General Fund deficit in fiscal years 2023–24 and 2024–25. She also reminded the Board members about the annual Form 700 filing requirement and timeframes for completing DCA's Board Member Orientation Training (BMOT) and trainings on ethics, sexual harassment prevention, and defensive driving.

**Public Comment:** None.

**6. Review and Possible Approval of July 20, 2023 and October 19–20, 2023 Board Meeting Minutes**

This agenda item was tabled for a future meeting.

**7. Review and Possible Ratification of Approved Doctor of Chiropractic License Applications**

**Motion:** Dr. Adams moved to ratify the approved doctor of chiropractic license applications.

**Second:** Dr. Daniels seconded the motion.

**Public Comment:** None.

**Vote:** 6-0 (Dr. Paris-AYE, Dr. Adams-AYE, Mr. Sweet-AYE, Ms. Cruz-AYE, Dr. Daniels-AYE, and Dr. Sandino-AYE).

**Motion:** Carried.

**8. Review and Possible Ratification of Approved Continuing Education Provider Applications**

**Motion:** Dr. Adams moved to ratify the continuing education provider applications.

**Second:** Dr. Sandino seconded the motion.

**Public Comment:** None.

**Vote:** 6-0 (Dr. Paris-AYE, Dr. Adams-AYE, Mr. Sweet-AYE, Ms. Cruz-AYE, Dr. Daniels-AYE, and Dr. Sandino-AYE).

**Motion:** Carried.

**9. Executive Officer's Report and Updates on:**

- A. Administration, Continuing Education, Enforcement, and Licensing Programs
- B. Business Modernization Project and Implementation of Connect System
- C. Board's Budget and Fund Condition
- D. Regulatory Process and Status of Board's Pending Proposals
- E. Board's 2022–2026 Strategic Plan Objectives

Ms. Walker shared that DCA launched an IT platform for the implementation of the Federal License Portability Law for Servicemembers as required by Senate Bill (SB) 143 (Committee on Budget and Fiscal Review, Chapter 196, Statutes of 2023), and established a method for boards and bureaus to receive and process requests for confidential licensee name and gender changes under the provisions of SB 372 (Menjivar, Chapter 225, Statutes of 2023). She also highlighted upcoming deadlines on the 2024 legislative calendar.

She announced that the Board is conducting an occupational analysis survey of the current chiropractic profession in California through January 26, 2024, and stated that DCA's Office of Professional Examination Services sent postcards and emails to all active licensees inviting them to participate in the survey.

Ms. Walker indicated the Board is finalizing the hiring process for two vacancies – an Enforcement Analyst and a Special Investigator – and shared that Administrative Technician Austin Maha's last day at the Board will be January 30, 2024, because he accepted a transfer opportunity at the California Department of Forestry and Fire Protection (CAL FIRE).

She briefly highlighted the licensing, continuing education (CE), and enforcement statistics within the meeting materials and provided an overview of the four phases of the DCA regulation package approval process – concept phase, production phase, initial filing phase, and final filing phase. She noted the Board's 23 pending regulatory proposals are a very heavy workload and shared a healthy long-term goal is to reduce that number to no more than 10 proposals across the four phases.

Dr. Adams noted and inquired about the delays in implementing the updated CE regulations. Ms. Walker acknowledged the delays and primarily attributed them to the need to compile and summarize about eight years of discussion on the topic for inclusion in the regulation package. Dr. Adams shared that he has received feedback that there are CE providers and licensees who are under the impression that videoconference courses count as live hours. Ms. Walker stated staff is working to develop regular updates to CE providers and licensees and noted the goal of CE audits is education and compliance, not to be overly punitive to a licensee if they misunderstood a specific requirement. Dr. Paris commented on the opportunity to utilize the Board's website and social media channels to address the confusion. Dr. Daniels agreed and suggested more transparency to stakeholders so they understand the process.

The Board moved to Agenda Item 10.

**10. Presentation and Discussion Regarding the Council on Chiropractic Education's (CCE) Accreditation Process for Doctor of Chiropractic Programs and Proposed Changes to the Accreditation Standards**

Craig Little, D.C., EdD, President and CEO of CCE, provided the Board with a presentation on CCE and its accreditation process for chiropractic programs and an overview of the proposed changes to the CCE accreditation standards. Dr. Little explained CCE's role in verifying academic quality and preparation of students to safely practice chiropractic while valuing educational freedom and institutional autonomy and encouraging innovation and advancement. He also highlighted the rapid transition to accelerated hybrid programs and competency-based assessments in many other health professions.

Dr. Daniels inquired about any challenges CCE has faced with the chiropractic programs using different assessments and measures. Dr. Little referenced CCE's white paper on best practices in assessment and explained the programs can have different tools and instruments of measure if they can demonstrate their validity and reliability to the specific competency outcomes. Dr. Daniels asked if the 1,000 clinical hours in the CCE standards include observation and when those hours begin. Dr. Little clarified it is 1,000 hours of actual clinical learning with instruments, virtual tools, and patient care.

Dr. Daniels asked about the updated educational standards for admission to the chiropractic programs and noted concerns with the impact on students from marginalized and underrepresented communities. Dr. Little explained those changes are based on CCE Policy 7 and detailed data gathered on the probability of student success in the chiropractic programs. Dr. Daniels also asked for CCE's definition and policy for equivalent education. Dr. Little replied the policy is still under development and cannot be released until after CCE approves the updated standards. He explained equivalent education must be evaluated by CCE and the institutional accreditor through a comprehensive process.

Dr. Sandino inquired about the credentials of CCE's program evaluators. Dr. Little explained CCE has an application and credentialing process and has a diverse group of about 70 evaluators with experience in education, practice, or regulation. He noted CCE also has very strict conflict of interest requirements.

Dr. Adams indicated the chiropractic educational requirements for entry into practice have increased since the initial regulation of the profession and asked if CCE has ever compared the competency and quality of care provided by doctors of chiropractic with varying levels of education. Dr. Little replied that he is not familiar with any specific study, but the requirements have been progressively and appropriately increasing over time and CCE has evidence of their effectiveness in producing quality, competent, and safe doctors of chiropractic.

**Public Comment:** Mr. Luouxmont questioned if the proposed changes would interfere with the check and balance system between the administrators and the government. He also disagreed with the proposed replacement of the words "state and federal law and regulations" with "applicable jurisdiction."

The Board returned to Agenda Item 9.

## **9. Executive Officer's Report and Updates (Continued)**

Ms. Walker provided an overview of the Board's fund condition and cautioned that while the Board's budget currently has significant savings due to position vacancies, staff and DCA are projecting increasing operating costs when the Board returns to its full staffing levels. She shared that staff will be conducting an updated fee analysis and cost assessment in 2025 and developing recommendations for potential inclusion in the

Board's 2026 sunset review report. She also summarized the strict spending restrictions over the next 18 months that are outlined in DOF's current year expenditure freeze.

Dr. Paris asked if the \$5.8 million spending projection for future fiscal years is based on actual projected costs or the full budgeted amount. Ms. Walker replied the figure represents an assumption of fully spending the Board's budget appropriation. She noted that figure is also an accurate assumption for a fully staffed office, but the Board could potentially spend closer to \$5.5 million after accounting for projected underspending of legal fees for services provided by the Attorney General's Office. Dr. Paris asked about the impact of the Board's decreasing licensee population on the budget. Ms. Walker replied that staff factors that decrease into the annual revenue projections and will also be incorporating it in the updated fee analysis.

**Public Comment:** None.

The Board moved to Agenda Item 12.

## **12. Licensing Committee Report**

- Committee Chair's Update on Pending Regulatory Proposals Being Considered and Developed by the Committee, Including Approval of Chiropractic Programs and Educational Requirements, Chiropractic Practice Locations and Display of License, Inactive Doctor of Chiropractic Licenses, and Order for Physical or Mental Examination of Applicants

Dr. Daniels updated the Board on her recent meetings with stakeholders to discuss the curriculum requirements and preceptorships. She shared that one stakeholder suggestion was to streamline the process for preceptor applications so interns can enter their programs faster. She also encouraged stakeholders to continue to engage with the Licensing Committee on the chiropractic program regulations and other licensing topics.

Dr. Paris, Ms. Walker, and Dr. Adams thanked and acknowledged Dr. Daniels for her extensive work on the chiropractic program regulations.

**Public Comment:** None.

## **13. Continuing Education Committee Report**

- Committee Chair's Update on December 1, 2023 Meeting

Dr. Paris shared that the Continuing Education Committee met on December 1, 2023, and engaged in robust policy discussions regarding the regulatory proposals to mandate basic life support certification as a condition of licensure in active status and to create a process for granting extensions to complete the CE requirements to licensees who have been adversely affected by a hardship during their license renewal period.

**Public Comment:** None.



#### **14. Government and Public Affairs Committee Report**

- Committee Chair's Update on December 4, 2023 Meeting

Ms. Cruz shared the Government and Public Affairs Committee met on December 4, 2023, and discussed the development of an updated fee analysis and recommendations in 2025 and strategies for improving the Board's effectiveness in the regulatory process. She also acknowledged the efforts of the Committee and staff to compile and develop resources and reference materials for Board members.

Dr. Paris thanked the Committee for tying the Board's work to the various 2022–2026 Strategic Plan objectives and monitoring the Board's progress in those areas.

**Public Comment:** None.

#### **15. Enforcement Committee Report**

- Committee Chair's Update on December 8, 2023 Meeting

Dr. Adams updated the Board on the December 8, 2023 Enforcement Committee and shared that the Committee continued the discussions of the regulatory proposals to update the minimum supervision and training requirements for unlicensed individuals within a practice, the record keeping requirements for chiropractic patient records, and the Board's *Disciplinary Guidelines and Model Disciplinary Orders*.

Dr. Daniels noted the conceptual language for the record keeping requirements specifies the patient's gender, height, and weight. She acknowledged gender and weight can be very sensitive subjects for patients and shared her concerns with the potential enforcement of those provisions. She suggested the Committee review those requirements further from that perspective and possibly consider making them a recommendation, rather than a requirement, or providing an option for the patient to not disclose them.

Dr. Daniels also asked the Committee to consider addressing whether patients are required to sign in at every visit to verify their actual presence. Dr. Adams shared that his practice has a form that patients use to sign in. Dr. Paris commented that it is not always feasible in integrated systems and clinics to have patients sign in, and in his experience, the provider documents a patient identifier, such as "patient was identified via their last name," in the encounter notes.

Dr. Daniels further suggested the Committee discuss adding language such as "including, but not limited to, orthopedic and neurological examination as appropriate to the area of chief complaint" to clarify the expectations and standard of care for examinations based on the Board's observations with enforcement cases.

**Public Comment:** None.



The Board returned to Agenda Item 11.

**11. Updates and Discussion on the California Doctor of Chiropractic Programs:**

- A. Life Chiropractic College West
- B. Palmer College of Chiropractic – West Campus
- C. Southern California University of Health Sciences, Los Angeles College of Chiropractic

Scott Donaldson, D.C., EdD, Provost of Life West, shared the Life West Advantage Package is a clinically inspired learning program that begins a student's clinical learning from day one of their chiropractic program. He also updated the Board on the high student participation rate in preceptorships and service trips and an observed increase in graduate confidence as a result of those experiences.

Dr. Adams asked Dr. Donaldson for an update on the program's expansion to a new Nebraska campus. Dr. Donaldson shared that Life West started a small focus program at Bellevue University in Nebraska that serves as an extension of the California campus. Dr. Donaldson noted Life West will be preparing to move from its existing site to another space in the area due to the increased industrialization of its current location.

Dr. Daniels asked if the pandemic affected students' ability to meet their clinical requirements. Dr. Donaldson explained students were still able to meet their quantitative clinical requirements, but preceptorship opportunities became more complex due to varying state regulations and restrictions on adjusting by students and interns.

John Scaringe, D.C., EdD, President and CEO of Southern California University of Health Sciences (SCUHS), shared that the institution has doubled its enrollment over the past five years, including growth in its chiropractic program with strong retention and graduation rates, national examination scores, and available concentrations in sports medicine, functional medicine, and nutrition. He stated SCUHS is looking to lead the way in integrated, whole healthcare and is launching many new programs in Whittier and Arizona. He added SCUHS is the academic affiliate of the Greater Los Angeles VA Healthcare System and has a strong relationship with local law enforcement through tactical sports medicine.

Dr. Scaringe shared his observations of trends in healthcare education consisting of online learning and concentrated, hands-on clinical education. He provided an example of SCUHS' doctor of occupational therapy program, which consists of 15-week terms with the first 12 weeks entirely online followed by three weeks of concentrated, hands-on learning on campus. He also encouraged the Board to focus on the outcomes of chiropractic education so programs can appropriately focus on student learning outcomes and competencies and have the flexibility to be competitive and move with the trends of other healthcare educational programs.

Dr. Paris asked Dr. Donaldson and Dr. Scaringe for their thoughts on CCE's proposed changes to the accreditation standards. Dr. Donaldson expressed his support for CCE's competency-based outcomes. Dr. Scaringe shared that he has an extensive background in accreditation and also supports the direction CCE is going with focusing on student learning outcomes rather than inputs.

Dr. Daniels asked Dr. Donaldson and Dr. Scaringe about their perception of the landscape of students entering chiropractic programs, and particularly any trends in their educational and socioeconomic background. Dr. Scaringe commented that SCUHS has a very diverse student population due to its location and efforts to work with and treat those in underserved areas and its diverse model of team-based care between many different health professionals. He added the student population exceeds the minimum admission requirements, and he is seeing students who are excited about coming into chiropractic. Dr. Donaldson explained that Life West participates in outreach at community colleges and treats the local community through its clinic. He also noted an increase in student accommodations following the pandemic.

Dr. Paris thanked Dr. Donaldson and Dr. Scaringe for updating the Board on their programs and for their work to move chiropractic education forward in California.

**Public Comment:** Mr. Luouxmont thanked Dr. Donaldson, Dr. Scaringe, the Board members, and staff for their efforts in chiropractic for California. He also reiterated his prior comment about the mislabeling of doctor-tiered marks and work in the clinic and asked the Board to consider a significant edit to correct that process.

The Board moved to Agenda Item 16.

## **16. Future Agenda Items**

Dr. Paris requested a discussion on animal chiropractic based on issues raised by stakeholders. He also requested a future agenda item to consider providing clarification to CE providers regarding hands-on manipulation or technique at a CE event.

**Public Comment:** None.

## **17. Closed Session**

The Board met in closed session to deliberate and vote on disciplinary matters and conduct the annual performance evaluation and consider the salary of its Executive Officer pursuant to Government Code section 11126, subdivisions (a)(1) and (c)(3).

## **18. Adjournment**

Dr. Paris adjourned the meeting at 4:34 p.m.

### Attachment A

#### List of Approved Applications for Initial Doctor of Chiropractic Licenses Issued from October 1, 2023 to December 31, 2023

First Name	Middle Name	Last Name	Date Issued	License No.*
Shane	Matthew	Lokken	10/03/2023	DC 35203
Michelle	Ann	Isaacson	10/09/2023	DC 35204
Alyssa	Jayne	Isaacson	10/09/2023	DC 35205
Lee	Michael	Isaacson	10/09/2023	DC 35206
Maksim	Igorevich	Ishankhanov	10/09/2023	DC 35207
Brianna	Michelle	Vullis	11/16/2023	DC 35208
Vida		Khalili	11/16/2023	DC 35209
Aleta	Louise	Bezzic	10/02/2023	DC 36783
Anna		Nguyen	10/03/2023	DC 36784
Jose		Landin	10/03/2023	DC 36785
Sherman		Zhu	10/03/2023	DC 36786
Heidi	Annette	Bansberg	10/03/2023	DC 36787
Tanya		Reyes	10/03/2023	DC 36788
Neda		Nima	10/05/2023	DC 36789
Colby		Rompal	10/05/2023	DC 36790
Zoe		Wight	10/05/2023	DC 36791
Vahe		Voskanyan	10/05/2023	DC 36792
George	J.	Attiah	10/05/2023	DC 36793
Tarek	F.	Tawil	10/05/2023	DC 36794
Mersedeh		Termechi	10/25/2023	DC 36795
Jordan		Grisette	10/25/2023	DC 36796
Marc		Constantino	10/25/2023	DC 36797
Abanoub		Mekhail	10/25/2023	DC 36798
Sarah		Jimenez	10/25/2023	DC 36799
John	Tyler	Richard	10/25/2023	DC 36800

First Name	Middle Name	Last Name	Date Issued	License No.*
Daniel		Axelrod	10/25/2023	DC 36801
James	Daegun	Yi	10/25/2023	DC 36802
Jon	Scott	Eckfeld	10/25/2023	DC 36803
Arthur		Chakrian	10/25/2023	DC 36804
Calissa	Michaela	Haney	10/25/2023	DC 36805
Amrit		Randhawa	10/25/2023	DC 36806
Benjamin		Rotman	10/25/2023	DC 36807
Christopher		Wang	10/25/2023	DC 36808
Maria	T.	Vazquez Orozco	10/25/2023	DC 36809
Jason		Frederick	10/25/2023	DC 36810
Joohee		Hyung	11/07/2023	DC 36811
James	Jones	Stewart	11/07/2023	DC 36812
George	Rogelio	Rodriguez	11/07/2023	DC 36813
Megan		Hippeli	11/07/2023	DC 36814
Mara	Anne	Trowbridge	11/07/2023	DC 36815
Kirby Edmund	Pasamba	Olidan	11/07/2023	DC 36816
Maxwell	Edward	Murphy	11/07/2023	DC 36817
Joshua		Dorado	11/07/2023	DC 36818
Cheuk Fung		Shek	11/07/2023	DC 36819
Trent	James	Darms	11/07/2023	DC 36820
Chun Ming		Chu	11/07/2023	DC 36821
Marco		Brine	12/01/2023	DC 36822
Hector		Guzman Hernandez	12/01/2023	DC 36823
Raja		Nijim	12/01/2023	DC 36824
Laurent	Aime	Derouaux	12/01/2023	DC 36825
Connor		Subocz-Quinn	12/01/2023	DC 36826
Amy	Carolina	Fang	12/01/2023	DC 36827
Debra		Foxfern	12/01/2023	DC 36828

First Name	Middle Name	Last Name	Date Issued	License No.*
Emily	Frances	Pilato	12/01/2023	<b>DC 36829</b>
Dhaamin	Zain	Clarke	12/01/2023	<b>DC 36830</b>
Alexandra	Marie	Wing-LaClaire	12/01/2023	<b>DC 36831</b>
Noah	Alexander	Esquibel	12/01/2023	<b>DC 36832</b>
Alyssa		Milward	12/12/2023	<b>DC 36833</b>

**Attachment B**

**List of Approved New Continuing Education Providers**

<b>Provider Name</b>	<b>CE Oversight Contact Person</b>	<b>Provider Status</b>
Benjamin DeLuca	Benjamin DeLuca	Corporation
Jarret Welsh	Jarret Welsh	Corporation
webFCE	William Metz	Corporation
Mount Madonna Institute of Ayurveda	Jackie Christensen	University/College
Simple Learning Systems	Jennifer Kelly	Corporation